



## Finite Groups With Certain Permutability Criteria

Rola A. Hijazi<sup>1</sup>, Fatme M. Charaf<sup>1,\*</sup>

<sup>1</sup> Department of Mathematics, Faculty of Science, King Abdulaziz University, Jeddah, Saudi Arabia

---

**Abstract.** Let  $G$  be a finite group. A subgroup  $H$  of  $G$  is said to be  $S$ -permutable in  $G$  if it permutes with all Sylow subgroups of  $G$ . In this note we prove that if  $P$ , the Sylow  $p$ -subgroup of  $G$  ( $p > 2$ ), has a subgroup  $D$  such that  $1 < |D| < |P|$  and all subgroups  $H$  of  $P$  with  $|H| = |D|$  are  $S$ -permutable in  $G$ , then  $G'$  is  $p$ -nilpotent.

**2010 Mathematics Subject Classifications:** 20D10, 20D20

**Key Words and Phrases:**  $S$ -Permutable Subgroup,  $p$ -Nilpotent Group, Solvable Group, Super-solvable Group.

---

### 1. Introduction

Throughout this note,  $G$  denotes a finite group. The relationship between the properties of the Sylow subgroups of a group  $G$  and its structure has been investigated by many authors. Starting from Gaschütz and Itô ([10], Satz 5.7, p.436) who proved that a group  $G$  is solvable if all its minimal subgroups are normal. In 1970, Buckley [4] proved that a group of odd order is supersolvable if all its minimal subgroups are normal (a subgroup of prime order is called a minimal subgroup). Recall that a subgroup is said to be  $S$ -permutable in  $G$  if it permutes with all Sylow subgroup of  $G$ . This concept, as a generalization of normality, was introduced by Kegel [11] in 1962 and has been studied extensively in many notes. For example, Srinivasan [15] in 1980 obtained the supersolvability of  $G$  under the assumption that the maximal subgroups of all Sylow subgroups are  $S$ -permutable in  $G$ . In 2000, Ballester-Bolinches et al. [3] introduced the  $c$ -supplementation concept of a finite group: A subgroup  $H$  of a group  $G$  is said to be  $c$ -supplemented in  $G$  if there exists a subgroup  $K$  of  $G$  such that  $G = HK$  and  $H \cap K \leq H_G$ , where  $H_G = Core_G(H)$  is the largest normal subgroup of  $G$  contained in  $H$ . By using this concept they were able to prove that a group  $G$  is solvable if and only if every Sylow subgroup of  $G$  is  $c$ -supplemented in  $G$ . Moreover, as an application, they got the supersolvability of a group  $G$  if all its minimal subgroups and the cyclic subgroups of order 4 are  $c$ -supplemented in  $G$ .

---

\*Corresponding author.

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.29020/nybg.ejpam.v12i2.3399>

Email addresses: [Rhijazi@kau.edu.sa](mailto:Rhijazi@kau.edu.sa) (R. Hijazi), [fa-sharaf@hotmail.com](mailto:fa-sharaf@hotmail.com) (F. Charaf)

In 2014, Heliel [8] proved that  $G$  is solvable if each subgroup of prime odd order of  $G$  is  $c$ -supplemented in  $G$ . Also he proved that  $G$  is solvable if and only if every Sylow subgroup of odd order of  $G$  is  $c$ -supplemented in  $G$ . This improved and generalized the results of Hall [6, 7], Ballester-Bolinches and Guo [2], and Ballester-Bolinches et al. [3]. Heliel also posted the following conjecture:

*Let  $G$  be a finite group such that every non-cyclic Sylow subgroup  $P$  of odd order of  $G$  has a subgroup  $D$  such that  $1 < |D| \leq |P|$  and all subgroups  $H$  of  $P$  with  $|H| = |D|$  are  $c$ -supplemented in  $G$ . Is  $G$  solvable?*

In the same year, Li et al. [12] presented a counterexample to show that the answer of this conjecture is negative in general and then gave a generalization of Heliel's theorems.

**Example 1.** *Let  $G = A_5 \times H$ , where  $A_5$  is the alternating group of degree 5 and  $H$  is an elementary group of order  $p^n$  with  $p > 5$  and  $n \geq 2$ . Then  $G$  satisfies the condition of the preceding conjecture, but  $G$  is not solvable.*

In 2015, Hijazi [9] continued the above mentioned investigations and proved the following: Suppose that each Sylow subgroup  $P$  of  $G$  has a subgroup  $D$  such that  $1 < |D| < |P|$  and all subgroups  $H$  of  $P$  with  $|H| = |D|$  are  $S$ -permutable in  $G$ . Then  $G$  is solvable.

The main goal of this note is to prove the following main theorem:

**Main Theorem 1.** *Let  $P$  be a Sylow  $p$ -subgroup of  $G$  ( $p > 2$ ). Suppose that  $P$  has a subgroup  $D$  such that  $1 < |D| < |P|$  and all subgroups  $H$  of  $P$  with  $|H| = |D|$  are  $S$ -permutable in  $G$ . Then  $G'$  is  $p$ -nilpotent.*

As immediate consequences of the main theorem we have:

**Corollary 1.** *Let  $P$  be a Sylow  $p$ -subgroup of  $G$  ( $p > 2$ ). Suppose that  $P$  has a subgroup  $D$  such that  $1 < |D| < |P|$  and all subgroups  $H$  of  $P$  with  $|H| = |D|$  are permutable in  $G$ . Then  $G'$  is  $p$ -nilpotent.*

**Corollary 2** ([9], Theorem 3.1). *Suppose that each Sylow subgroup  $P$  of  $G$  has a subgroup  $D$  such that  $1 < |D| < |P|$  and all subgroups  $H$  of  $P$  with  $|H| = |D|$  are  $S$ -permutable in  $G$ . Then  $G$  is solvable.*

**Corollary 3** (Gaschütz and Itô [10], Satz 5.7, p.436 ). *A group  $G$  is solvable if all its minimal subgroups are normal.*

## 2. Proofs

We first prove the following theorems:

**Theorem 2.** *Let  $P$  be a Sylow  $p$ -subgroup of a group  $G$ , where  $p$  is an odd prime. If each subgroup of  $P$  of order  $p$  is  $S$ -permutable in  $G$ , then  $G'$  is  $p$ -nilpotent.*

*Proof.* We prove the theorem by induction on  $|G|$ . Hence if each subgroup of  $P$  of order  $p$  is normal in  $G$ , then each subgroup of  $G'$  of order  $p$  is normal in  $G'$ . Let  $L$  be a

subgroup of  $G'$  such that  $|L| = p$ . Then  $G/C_G(L) \subseteq \text{Aut}(L)$  and, since  $\text{Aut}(L)$  is cyclic of order  $p - 1$ , we have  $G/C_G(L)$  is abelian. Thus  $G' \leq C_G(L)$  and so  $L \leq Z(G')$ . By ([10], Satz 5.5(a), p. 435),  $G'$  is  $p$ -nilpotent. Thus we may assume that there exists a subgroup  $H$  of  $P$  of order  $p$  such that  $H$  is not normal in  $G$ . By the hypothesis,  $H$  is  $S$ -permutable in  $G$  and hence by ([13], Lemma A),  $O^p(G) \leq N_G(H) < G$ . Let  $M$  be a maximal subgroup of  $G$  such that  $N_G(H) \leq M < G$ . Then  $M \triangleleft G$  and  $|G/M| = p$ . By induction on  $|G|$ ,  $M'$  is  $p$ -nilpotent. Hence if  $O_{p'}(G) \neq 1$ ,  $G/O_{p'}(G)$  satisfies the hypothesis of the theorem and so  $(G/O_{p'}(G))' = G'O_{p'}(G)/O_{p'}(G) \cong G'/(G' \cap O_{p'}(G))$  is  $p$ -nilpotent which implies that  $G'$  is  $p$ -nilpotent. Thus assume that  $O_{p'}(G) = 1$ . Since  $M' \text{ char } M$  and  $M \triangleleft G$ , we have  $M' \triangleleft G$ . As  $M'$  is  $p$ -nilpotent and  $O_{p'}(G) = 1$ , we have  $M'$  is a  $p$ -group. Then  $P_1 \triangleleft M$  where  $P_1$  is a Sylow  $p$ -subgroup of  $M$ . By Schur-Zassenhaus Theorem [5, Theorem 6.2.1, p. 221],  $M = P_1K$ , where  $K$  is a  $p'$ -Hall subgroup of  $M$ . Hence if  $C_G(P_1) \leq P_1$ ,  $K$  is a  $p'$ -group of automorphisms of  $P_1$ , and since  $K$  leaves each subgroup of  $P_1$  invariant because every subgroup of  $P$  of prime order is  $S$ -permutable, then by ([14], Lemma 2.20),  $K$  is cyclic. Let  $Q$  be a Sylow  $q$ -subgroup of  $K$ , where  $q$  is a prime divisor of the order of  $K$ . Hence if  $p < q$ , then  $P_1Q = P_1 \times Q$  and this means that  $Q \leq C_G(P_1)$ , a contradiction. Thus  $p$  is the largest prime dividing  $|G|$  and since  $K$  is cyclic, it follows, by Burnside's  $p$ -Nilpotent Theorem ([10], Satz 2.8, p.420), that  $P \triangleleft G$ . But  $G/P \cong K$ , therefore  $G/P$  is cyclic and so abelian, then  $G' \leq P$ . This completes the proof of the theorem.

As a corollary of Theorem 2.1:

**Corollary 4.** *If each subgroup of prime order of  $G$  is  $S$ -permutable in  $G$ , then  $G$  is solvable,  $S \triangleleft G'$  and  $G'/S$  is nilpotent, where  $S$  is a Sylow 2-subgroup of  $G'$ .*

*Proof.* By Theorem 2.1,  $G'$  is  $p$ -nilpotent for each odd prime  $p$  dividing  $|G|$ . So  $G'/S$  is nilpotent,  $S$  is a Sylow 2-subgroup of  $G'$  and hence  $G$  is solvable.

**Theorem 3.** *Let  $p$  be an odd prime and let  $P$  be a Sylow  $p$ -subgroup of  $G$ . Suppose that  $P$  has a subgroup  $D$  such that  $1 < |D| < |P|$  and all subgroups  $H$  of  $P$  with  $|H| = |D|$  are normal in  $G$ . Then  $G'$  is  $p$ -nilpotent.*

*Proof.* We prove the theorem by induction on  $|G|$ . Clearly,  $P \cap G'$  is a Sylow  $p$ -subgroup of  $G'$ . Set  $P_1 = P \cap G'$ . We deal with the following two cases:

**Case 1.**  $|P_1| \leq |D|$ .

Hence if  $|D| = p$ ,  $|P_1| = p$ , and  $P_1 \triangleleft G$ . Then  $G' \leq C_G(P_1)$  and so  $P_1 \leq Z(G')$ . Hence, by Schur-Zassenhaus Theorem,  $G' = P_1 \times K$ , where  $K$  is a  $p'$ -Hall subgroup of  $G'$ .

In particular,  $G'$  is  $p$ -nilpotent.

Thus we may assume that  $|D| = p^n$  ( $n \geq 2$ ). Let  $H$  be a subgroup of  $P$  with  $|H| = |D|$  such that  $P_1 \leq H < P$ . By the hypothesis,  $H \triangleleft G$ . Assume that  $\Phi(H) \neq 1$  and consider the factor group  $G/\Phi(H)$ . Obviously,  $G/\Phi(H)$  satisfies the theorem hypothesis and so  $(G/\Phi(H))' = G'\Phi(H)/\Phi(H)$  is  $p$ -nilpotent by the induction on  $|G|$ . But  $G'\Phi(H)/\Phi(H) \cong G'/G' \cap \Phi(H)$  and  $\Phi(H) \leq \Phi(G)$ , then we have  $G' \cap \Phi(H) \leq G' \cap \Phi(G)$  and therefore

$G'/G' \cap \Phi(G)$  is  $p$ -nilpotent. Now  $G'\Phi(G)/\Phi(G) \cong G'/G' \cap \Phi(G)$  is  $p$ -nilpotent implies that  $G'\Phi(G)$  is  $p$ -nilpotent and consequently  $G'$  is  $p$ -nilpotent.

Thus we may assume that  $\Phi(H) = 1$  and so  $H$  is elementary abelian  $p$ -group of order  $p^n$  ( $n \geq 2$ ). Let  $L$  be a subgroup of  $P$  contains  $H$  such that  $H$  is maximal in  $L$ . Clearly,  $L$  is not cyclic because  $H$  is elementary abelian group of order  $p^n$  ( $n \geq 2$ ). Then  $L$  contains a subgroup  $H_1$  such that  $|H_1| = |D|$  and  $H_1 \neq H$ . By the hypothesis,  $H_1 \triangleleft G$  and since  $H \triangleleft G$ , we have  $L = H_1H \triangleleft G$  and so  $\Phi(L) \leq \Phi(G)$ . Hence if  $\Phi(L) \neq 1$ ,  $\Phi(L) \leq H_1 < L \leq P$ . Since  $L$  is not cyclic, we have  $\Phi(L)$  is contained properly in  $H_1$ . Now it is easy to notice that the factor group  $G/\Phi(L)$  satisfies the hypothesis of the theorem, so by induction on  $|G|$ ,  $G'$  is  $p$ -nilpotent. Thus we may assume that  $\Phi(L) = 1$  and so  $P_1$  is elementary abelian  $p$ -group. Since  $P_1 \leq H < L \leq P$  and  $H$  is maximal in  $L$ , it follows that  $|L| = p^{n+1}$ . Let  $L_1 = \langle x_1 \rangle$  be a subgroup of  $P_1$  of order  $p$ . Then  $L = \langle x_1 \rangle \times \langle x_2 \rangle \times \dots \times \langle x_{n+1} \rangle$ . By the hypothesis, each maximal subgroup of  $L$  is normal in  $G$ . Applying ([1], Lemma 2.9) implies that each subgroup of  $L$  of order  $p$  is normal in  $G$ ; in particular each subgroup  $L_1$  of  $P_1$  of order  $p$  is normal in  $G$ . So,  $G' \leq C_G(L_1)$  and consequently  $P_1 \leq Z(G')$ . By Schur-Zassenhaus Theorem,  $G' = P_1 \times K_1$ , where  $K_1$  is a  $p'$ -Hall subgroup of  $G$ ; in particular  $G'$  is  $p$ -nilpotent.

**Case 2.**  $|P_1| > |D|$ .

Hence if  $|D| = p$ , then every subgroup of  $P_1$  of order  $p$  is normal in  $G$ , so  $\Omega_1(P_1) \leq Z(G')$  which implies that  $G'$  is  $p$ -nilpotent by ([10], Satz 5.5(a), p 435). Thus assume that  $|D| = p^n$  ( $n \geq 2$ ). Hence if  $\Phi(D) \neq 1$ ,  $G/\Phi(D)$  satisfies the hypothesis of the theorem and so  $(G/\Phi(D))' = G'\Phi(D)/\Phi(D)$  is  $p$ -nilpotent by induction on  $|G|$  which implies that  $G'/G' \cap \Phi(G)$  is  $p$ -nilpotent; in particular  $G'$  is  $p$ -nilpotent. Thus we may assume that  $\Phi(D) = 1$ . Let  $L \leq P_1$  such that  $D$  is maximal in  $L$ . Then  $|L| = p^{n+1}$  ( $n \geq 2$ ). Clearly  $L$  is not cyclic. Then there exists a maximal subgroup  $L_1 \neq D$  in  $L$ . By the hypothesis  $L_1 \triangleleft G$  and  $D \triangleleft G$  which implies that  $L = L_1D \triangleleft G$ . Hence if  $\Phi(L) \neq 1$ ,  $\Phi(L) \leq D < L \leq P_1$  and since  $L$  is not cyclic, it follows that  $\Phi(L) < D$ . By induction on  $|G|$ ,  $G'\Phi(L)/\Phi(L) \cong G'/G' \cap \Phi(L)$  is  $p$ -nilpotent. In particular,  $G'\Phi(G)/\Phi(G)$  is  $p$ -nilpotent and it follows easily that  $G'$  is  $p$ -nilpotent. So we may assume that  $\Phi(L) = 1$  and so  $L$  is elementary abelian. Let  $L_1 < P$  such that  $|L_1| = p$ . Then  $L_1 < L \leq P_1$  and so  $L_1 \triangleleft G$  by ([1], Lemma 2.9). In particular,  $\Omega_1(P_1) \leq Z(G')$ . Again by ([10], Satz 5.5(a), p 435),  $G'$  is  $p$ -nilpotent. This completes the proof of the theorem.

Now we can move forward to prove our main theorem:

*Proof.* We prove the theorem by induction on  $|G|$ . Hence if  $O_{p'}(G) \neq 1$ ,  $G/O_{p'}(G)$  satisfies the hypothesis of the theorem and so  $(G/O_{p'}(G))'$  is  $p$ -nilpotent by induction on  $|G|$ ; in particular,  $G'$  is  $p$ -nilpotent. Thus we may assume that  $O_{p'}(G) = 1$ . If each subgroup  $H$  of  $P$  with  $|H| = |D|$  is normal in  $G$ , then  $G'$  is  $p$ -nilpotent by Theorem 2.2. So we may assume that there exists a subgroup  $H$  of  $P$  with  $|H| = |D|$  and  $H$  is not normal in  $G$ . By hypothesis,  $H$  is  $S$ -permutable in  $G$ . Since  $H \not\triangleleft G$  and  $H$  is  $S$ -permutable in  $G$ , we have by ([13], Lemma A) that  $O^p(G) \leq N_G(H) < G$ . Let  $M$  be a maximal subgroup of  $G$  contains  $N_G(H)$  properly. Then  $M \triangleleft G$  and  $|G/M| = p$ . Let  $P_1 = P \cap M$  be a Sylow  $p$ -subgroup of  $M$ . By the hypothesis,  $|D| \leq |P_1|$ . If  $|D| = |P_1|$ , then  $|H| = |P_1|$  and so

$P \leq N_G(H)$ , and since  $O^p(G) \leq N_G(H)$ , we have  $PO^p(G) = G \leq N_G(H) < M$  which is impossible. Thus we may assume that  $|D| < |P_1|$ . Now  $M'$  is  $p$ -nilpotent, by the inductive hypothesis, implies that  $M'$  is a  $p$ -group because  $O_{p'}(G) = 1$ . Then  $P_1$  is characteristic in  $M$  and since  $M \triangleleft G$ , we have  $P_1 \triangleleft G$ . If  $P \triangleleft G$ , then  $G/P$  is abelian and since all subgroups  $H$  of  $P$  with  $|H| = |D|$  are  $S$ -permutable in  $G$ , we have that  $G$  is supersolvable by ([14], Theorem 1.3) and so  $G'$  is nilpotent; in particular  $G'$  is  $p$ -nilpotent. Thus we may assume that  $P \not\triangleleft G$  and  $P_1 = F(G)$  the Fitting subgroup of  $G$  (recall that  $O_{p'}(G) = 1$  and that  $F(G) = \langle O_p(G) \text{ for all } p \text{ divides } |G| \rangle$ ). Consider the subgroup  $\Phi(P_1)$  and assume that  $\Phi(P_1) \neq 1$ . Hence if  $|\Phi(P_1)| < |D|$ , then  $(G/\Phi(P_1))'$  is  $p$ -nilpotent by induction on  $|G|$ ; in particular  $G'$  is  $p$ -nilpotent. So assume that  $|\Phi(P_1)| \geq |D|$ . If  $|\Phi(P_1)| = |D|$ , then  $P/\Phi(P_1)$  is not cyclic. Let  $L/\Phi(P_1)$  be a proper subgroup of  $P/\Phi(P_1)$  such that  $|L/\Phi(P_1)| = p$  ( $L$  is not cyclic; otherwise  $\Phi(P_1)$  is cyclic and this implies that there exists  $L_1 \leq \Phi(P_1)$  such that  $L_1 \triangleleft G$ ; in particular  $G/C_G(L_1)$  is isomorphic to a subgroup of  $Aut(L_1)$  and so  $G' \leq C_G(L_1)$  and we conclude then that  $G'$  is  $p$ -nilpotent). As  $|L/\Phi(P_1)| = p$ , then there exists a maximal subgroup  $L_1$  of  $L$  such that  $|L_1| = |\Phi(P_1)| = |D|$  and  $L_1 \neq \Phi(P_1)$ . But  $L_1\Phi(P_1)$  is  $S$ -permutable in  $G$ , then  $L_1\Phi(P_1)/\Phi(P_1) = L/\Phi(P_1)$  is  $S$ -permutable in  $G/\Phi(P_1)$ . By Theorem 2.1,  $(G/\Phi(P_1))' = G'\Phi(P_1)/\Phi(P_1)$  is  $p$ -nilpotent and so  $G'$  is  $p$ -nilpotent. Thus we may assume that  $\Phi(P_1) = 1$  and  $P_1$  is elementary abelian. Since all subgroups  $H$  of  $P_1$  with  $|H| = |D|$  are normal in  $M$ , we have by ([1], Lemma 2.9) that all subgroups of  $P_1$  of order  $p$  are normal in  $M$ . So  $P_1 \cap Z(P) \neq 1$ . Let  $L \leq P_1 \cap Z(P)$  such that  $|L| = p$ . Then  $L \triangleleft G$  and since  $G/C_G(L)$  is isomorphic to a subgroup of  $Aut(L)$ , we have that  $G' \leq C_G(L)$ , in particular  $G'L/L$  is  $p$ -nilpotent and so  $G'$  is  $p$ -nilpotent. This completes the proof of the theorem.

## References

- [1] M. Asaad and A. A. Heliel, On  $S$ -quasinormally embedded subgroups of finite groups, JPAA 165(2001) 129-135.
- [2] A. Ballester-Bolinches and X. Guo, On complemented subgroups of finite groups, Arch. Math. 72(1999) 161-166.
- [3] A. Ballester-Bolinches, Y. Wang and X. Guo (2000),  $C$ -supplemented subgroups of finite groups, Glasgow Math. J. 42(2000) 383-389.
- [4] J. Buckley, Finite groups whose minimal subgroups are normal, Math. Z. 116(1970) 15-17.
- [5] D. Gorenstein, Finite Groups, American Mathematical Society, 1980.
- [6] P. Hall, A characteristic property of solvable groups, J. London Math. Soc. 12(1937) 198-200.
- [7] P. Hall, Complemented Groups, J. London Math. Soc. 12(1937) 201-204.

- [8] A. A. Heliel, A note on  $c$ -supplemented subgroups of finite groups, *Comm. Algebra* 42(2014) 1650-1656.
- [9] R. Hijazi, A note on solvability of finite groups, *Journal of Advances in Mathematics* 10(2015) 3639-3642.
- [10] B. Huppert, *Endliche Gruppen I*, Springer, Berlin-New York, 1979.
- [11] O. H. Kegel, Sylow-Gruppen und Subnormalteiler endlicher Gruppen, *Math. Z.* 78(1962) 205-221.
- [12] J. Li, W. Shi, G. Chen and D. Yu, New characterization of solubility of finite groups, *Italian J. Pure Appl. Math.* 33(2014) 377-382.
- [13] P. Schmid, Subgroups permutable with all Sylow subgroups, *J. Algebra*, 207 (1998) 285-293.
- [14] A. N. Skiba, On weakly  $S$ -permutable subgroups of finite groups, *J. Algebra*, 315(2007) 192-209.
- [15] S. Srinivasan, Two sufficient conditions for supersolvability of finite groups, *Israel J. Math.* 35(1980) 210-214.