



Monotone flows with dense periodic orbits

Morris W. Hirsch

Department of Mathematics, University of Wisconsin at Madison, WI 53706, USA

Abstract. The main result is Theorem 1: A flow on a connected open set $X \subset \mathbb{R}^d$ is globally periodic provided (i) periodic points are dense in X , and (ii) at all positive times the flow preserves the partial order defined by a closed convex cone that has nonempty interior and contains no straight line. The proof uses the analog for homeomorphisms due to B. LEMMENS *et al.* [27], a classical theorem of D. MONTGOMERY [31, 32], and a sufficient condition for the nonstationary periodic points in a closed order interval to have rationally related periods (Theorem 2).

2010 Mathematics Subject Classifications: 37C65, 37C25, 57Sxx

Key Words and Phrases: Monotone dynamical systems, Periodic points, Topological transformation groups

1. Introduction

Many dynamical systems (φ, X) , especially those used as models in applied fields, are *monotone*: The state space X has a nontrivial (partial) order which the dynamic $\varphi := \{\varphi^t\}_{t \in \mathbb{R}}$ preserves in positive time:

$$y \geq x \implies \varphi^t y \geq \varphi^t x, \quad (t \geq 0).$$

The great virtue of monotone systems is that long-term behavior of trajectories tends to be comparatively simple. While there can be exotic invariant sets, it is commonly the case that there are large sets of initial states $x(0)$ for which $x(t)$ approaches the fixed point set as t becomes infinite. This holds for cooperative systems (1) when the inequalities (2) are strict (HIRSCH [16]).

Example. Consider a population divided into n groups labeled $i = 1, \dots, n$. At time t the state of the system is characterized by a vector $x(t) \in \mathbb{R}^n$ whose i 'th component $x_i(t)$ is the size (or density, concentration, probability, etc.) of group i . The growth rate of the groups is governed by a system of differential equations in the positive orthant $\mathbb{R}_+^n = [0, \infty)^n$, having Kolmogorov form ([23, 39]):

$$\frac{dx_i}{dt} = x_i \sum_{j=1}^n g_{ij}(x_1, \dots, x_n), \quad x_i \geq 0 \quad (i = 1, \dots, n). \quad (1)$$

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.29020/nybg.ejpam.v12i4.3534>

Email address: mwhirsch@chorus.net (M. W. Hirsch)

The system is *cooperative* (or “mutualist”) if the growth rate of population i tends to increase with the size of each population $j \neq i$, modeled by

$$\frac{\partial g_{ij}}{\partial x_j} \geq 0, \quad i \neq j. \quad (2)$$

When the functions g_{ij} are continuously differentiable, this assumption makes the positive-time solution process preserve the vector order on \mathbb{R}^n determined by the cone $\mathbb{R}_+^n := [0, \infty)^n$:

$$s \leq t \implies x_i(s) \leq x_i(t), \quad (i = 1, \dots, n).$$

If the inequality on partial derivatives in Equation (2) is reversed, the system is called *competitive*.

Another common dynamical property is *dense periodicity*: the set of periodic points is dense. Often considered typical of chaotic dynamics, this condition is closely connected to many other important dynamical topics: structural stability, ergodic theory, Hamiltonian mechanics, smoothness and so forth. But in contrast to monotonicity, dense periodicity is usually demonstrated only in certain compact sets.

The goal of this article is to show that flows that are both monotonic and densely periodic are rare, because they are *globally periodic*: Our main result, Theorem 1, implies that such a flow factors through an action of the circle group.

For a sampling of the large literature on monotone dynamics, consult the following works and references therein: [1–4, 6–9, 12, 15, 20, 25, 28–30, 34, 36, 38, 40, 44–46]. Surveys of order-preserving dynamical systems are given in [19, 26, 41, 42].

1.1. Terminology

Let \mathbb{Z} denote the integers, \mathbb{N} the nonnegative integers, \mathbb{N}_+ the positive integers, \mathbb{R} the reals, and \mathbb{Q}_+ the positive rationals. \mathbb{R}^d is d -dimensional Euclidean space.

A subset S of a topological space Y is given the induced topology. When Y has been specified, the closure of S is denoted by \bar{S} .

Maps between topological spaces are always assumed continuous.

Let X be an *ordered space*: a topological space endowed with a partial order relation generally symbolized by \geq , and denoted formally as (X, \geq) . If (X', \geq') is also an ordered space, a map $T: X \rightarrow X'$ is *monotone* provided $x \geq y \implies Tx \geq' Ty$.

We write $x \leq y$ as a synonym for $y \geq x$. If $y \geq x$ and $y \neq x$, we write $y > x$, $x < y$. For sets $A, B \subset X$, the notation $A \geq B$ means $a \geq b$ for all $a \in A, b \in B$; and similarly for $>$ and so forth.

The partial order is always assumed to be *closed* as a binary relation: The sets

$$\{(x, y) \in X \times X: x \geq y\}, \quad \{(x, y) \in X \times X: x \leq y\}$$

are closed in $X \times X$. Consequently:

- For all $p \in X$, the sets $\{x \in X: x \geq p\}$ and $\{y \in X: y \leq p\}$ are closed in X .
- If $\lim_i a_i = a$, $\lim_i b_i = b$, and $a_i \geq b_i$, then $a \geq b$.

The *order interval* $[a, b]$ is the closed set $\{x \in X: a \leq x \leq b\}$; its interior is the *open order interval* $[[a, b]]$. We write $a \ll b$ to indicate $[[a, b]] \neq \emptyset$.

Let $f: Y \rightarrow Z$ be a map. For $k \in \mathbb{N}$, the k 'th iterate $f^k: y \rightarrow y_k$ is the map defined recursively by:

$$y_0 = y, \quad y_k = f(y_{k-1}) \text{ if } y_{k-1} \in Y.$$

The *fixed point set* of f is

$$\mathcal{F}(f) := \{x: f(x) = x\}$$

and the *periodic set* is

$$\mathcal{P}(f) := \bigcup_k \mathcal{F}(f^k).$$

A *flow* on X is an indexed family $\psi := \{\psi^t\}_{t \in \mathbb{R}}$ of homeomorphisms $\psi^t: X \approx X$ such that

$$\psi^r \circ \psi^s = \psi^{r+s}, \quad (r, s \in \mathbb{R}), \tag{3}$$

and the *evaluation map*

$$\text{ev}_\psi: \mathbb{R} \times X \rightarrow X, \quad (t, x) \mapsto \psi^t x \tag{4}$$

is continuous. When X is ordered, ψ is *monotone* provided the maps $\psi^t, t \geq 0$ are monotone.

Example. A flow on \mathbb{R}^n defined by a cooperative system of differential equations (1), (2) is monotone for the *vector order*

$$x \geq y \iff x_i \geq y_i, \quad (i = 1, \dots, n).$$

A set $Y \subset X$ is *invariant* under ψ if $\psi^t Y = Y$ for all $t \in \mathbb{R}$, and $\psi|_Y$ denotes the flow in Y whose evaluation map (4) is

$$\text{ev}_{\psi|_Y}: (t, y) \mapsto \psi^t y, \quad (t, y) \in \mathbb{R} \times Y.$$

The *orbit* of x is

$$\mathcal{O}(x) := \{\psi^t x: t \in \mathbb{R}\},$$

and the orbit of a set $S \subset X$ is

$$\mathcal{O}(S) := \bigcup_{x \in S} \mathcal{O}(x).$$

Since orbits are invariant and the flow on an orbit is transitive, distinct orbits are disjoint.

The *periodic set* of ψ is

$$\mathcal{P} = \mathcal{P}(\psi) := \bigcup_{t>0} \mathcal{P}(\psi^t)$$

and the *equilibrium set* is

$$\mathcal{E} = \mathcal{E}(\psi) := \bigcap_{t \in \mathbb{R}} \mathcal{F}(\psi^t).$$

If $p \in \mathcal{P} \setminus \mathcal{E}$, its *period* is

$$\text{per}(p) = \text{per}(p, \psi) := \min \{t > 0: \psi^t p = p\} > 0,$$

and $O(p)$ is a cycle. If $\text{per}(p) = r > 0$, the flow $\psi|_{O(p)}$ is topologically conjugate to the flow on the topological circle $\mathbb{R}/r\mathbb{Z}$ covered by the translational flow on \mathbb{R} . Since the flows on cycles are transitive, every cycle is *unordered*: no two points are related by $>$.

The flow is called:

- *densely periodic* if \mathcal{P} is dense in X ,
- *pointwise periodic* if $\mathcal{P} = X$,
- *globally periodic* if ψ^t is the identity map of X for some $t > 0$,
- *monotone* if ψ^t is monotone for all $t \geq 0$.

This is the chief result:

Theorem 1 (MAIN). *Assume:*

- (H1) X is a connected open set in d -dimensional Euclidean space \mathbb{R}^d .
- (H2) $K \subset \mathbb{R}^d$ is a closed cone with nonempty interior that is convex (contains the line segment joining any two of its points), solid (has nonempty interior), and pointed (contains no straight line).
- (H3) The order on X is defined as: $x \geq y \iff x - y \in K$.
- (H4) φ is a monotone flow on X .
- (H5) φ is densely periodic.

Then φ is globally periodic.

2. Resonant flows

Let ψ denote a monotone flow on an arbitrary ordered space X .

Definition. A set $S \subset X$ is *resonant* and ψ is *resonant in S* , provided:

$$a, b \in S \cap \mathcal{P} \setminus \mathcal{E} \implies \text{per}(a)/\text{per}(b) \in \mathbb{Q}_+.$$

It is easy to see that:

- If S is resonant, so is its orbit and every subset.
- The intersection of resonant sets is resonant.
- The union of resonant sets is resonant if their intersection meets a cycle,

Theorem 2 (RESONANCE CRITERION). *Assume*

$$p, q \in \mathcal{P} \setminus \mathcal{E}, \quad [p, q] \subset X, \quad p < q, \quad O(p) \neq O(q). \tag{5}$$

Then $[p, q]$ is resonant.

Proof. Set

$$\text{per}(p) = r > 0, \quad \text{per}(q) = s > 0. \tag{6}$$

I claim:

$$r/s \text{ is rational.} \tag{7}$$

This is trivial if $r = s$. To fix ideas, assume $r < s$, the case $r > s$ being similar. Set $\xi := r/s$. For all $n, m \in \mathbb{Z}$:

$$p = (\psi^r)^n p = \psi^{nr} p, \quad q = (\psi^s)^m q = \psi^{ms} q.$$

Monotonicity implies

$$p = \psi^{nr} p < \psi^{nr} q = \psi^{nr+ms} q = \psi^{(n\xi+m)s} q,$$

whence

$$p < \psi^{(n\xi+m)s} q, \quad (n, m \in \mathbb{Z}). \tag{8}$$

Assume *per contra* that ξ is irrational. Then

$$\Lambda := \{(n\xi + m)s : n, m \in \mathbb{Z}\}.$$

is dense in \mathbb{R} ,* whence

$$\Gamma := \{\Phi^t q : t \in \Lambda\}$$

is dense in $O(q)$. As the partial order relation is closed, (8) implies

$$p \leq \Gamma \subset \bar{\Gamma} = O(q). \tag{9}$$

Invariance of cycles implies $O(p) \leq O(q)$ by (9), monotonicity of ψ , and transitivity of $\psi|O(p)$. Therefore disjointness of $O(p)$ and $O(q)$ implies $O(p) < O(q)$. Since this contradicts the hypothesis, (7) is proved.

Next we prove:

$$u \in [p, q] \cap \mathcal{P} \setminus \mathcal{E} \implies \frac{\text{per}(u)}{\text{per}(q)} \in \mathbb{Q}_+. \tag{10}$$

This is trivial if $u \in \mathcal{E}$ or $u = q$, so we assume $u \notin \mathcal{E}$ and $p \leq u < q$. Note that $O(u) \not\leq O(q)$ because otherwise $O(p) < O(q)$, contrary to hypothesis. Therefore (10) follows from (7).

Resonance of $[u, v]$ now follows: If $u, v \in [p, q] \cap \mathcal{P} \setminus \mathcal{E}$, then applying the claim to both u and v gives:

$$\frac{\text{per}(u)}{\text{per}(v)} = \frac{\text{per}(u)}{\text{per}(q)} \cdot \frac{\text{per}(q)}{\text{per}(v)} \in \mathbb{Q}_+.$$

Proposition 1. *Let $p, q \in \mathcal{P}(\psi) \setminus \mathcal{E}(\psi)$ satisfy (5). If $\mathcal{P}(\psi)$ is dense in $[p, q]$, there exists $l > 0$ such that:*

*Equivalently: The orbit of a rotation of the circle \mathbf{S}^1 through an irrational multiple of π is dense in \mathbf{S}^1 . This result is ancient, going back to NICOLE ORESME in the 14th century! See GRANT [11], KAR [21]. A short proof based on the pigeon-hole principle is in SPEYER [43]. Stronger density theorems are in BOHR [5], KRONECKER [24], WEYL [47, 48].

$$(a) \mathcal{P}(\psi) \cap [p, q] = \mathcal{P}(\psi^l) \cap [p, q],$$

$$(b) \mathcal{P}(\psi^l) \text{ is dense in } [p, q],$$

$$(c) \psi^l[p, q] = [p, q].$$

Proof. Let $\text{per}(p) = r > 0$. Because $[p, q]$ is resonant (Theorem 2), if $z \in [p, q] \cap \mathcal{P}(\psi) \setminus \mathcal{E}(\psi)$ there exists $r \in \mathbb{N}_+$ such that $\psi^r z = z$.

Since the periods of all points in $[p, q] \cap \mathcal{P}(\psi) \setminus \mathcal{E}(\psi)$ are rational multiples of r , there exist $m, n \in \mathbb{N}_+$ such that:

$$(\psi^r)^m p = p, \quad (\psi^r)^n q = q, \quad \text{and} \quad \mathcal{P}(\psi) \cap [p, q] = \mathcal{P}(\psi^r) \cap [p, q],$$

validating (a) and (b) for $l := mnr$. Monotonicity implies $\psi^l[p, q] \subset [p, q]$, so (c) follows from (b) and continuity of ψ^l .

2.1. Proof of Theorem 1

Recall the hypotheses, assumed henceforth:

(H1) X is a connected open set in d -dimensional Euclidean space \mathbb{R}^d .

(H2) $K \subset \mathbb{R}^d$ is a closed convex cone that has nonempty interior and contains no straight line.

(H3) The partial order relation on X is determined by K :

$$x \geq y \iff x - y \in K.$$

(H4) φ is a monotone flow on X .

(H5) φ is densely periodic.

The conclusion is: φ is globally periodic.

Definition. A homeomorphism $T: X \approx X$ is:

- *densely periodic* if $\mathcal{P}(T)$ is dense in X ,
- *pointwise periodic* if $\mathcal{P}(T) = X$,
- *globally periodic* if T^k is the identity map of X for some $k \in \mathbb{N}_+$.

A crucial ingredient in the proof of Theorem 1 is the recently proved analog for monotone homeomorphisms:

Theorem 3 (B. LEMMENS *et al.* [27]). *Assume (H1), (H2), (H3). Then a monotone homeomorphism $T: X \approx X$ is globally periodic provided it is densely periodic.*[†]

[†]Conjectured in M. HIRSCH [18], and proved for polyhedral cones K .

We will also use an elegant result from the early days of transformation groups:

Theorem 4 (D. MONTGOMERY [31, 32]). *A homeomorphism of a connected topological manifold is globally periodic provided it is pointwise periodic.*[‡]

Proposition 2. *Let $x \in X \setminus \mathcal{E}$ be arbitrary. There is an open neighborhood*

$$W_x \subset X \setminus \mathcal{E}$$

of x , and a real number $l := l_x > 0$, such that:

$$\varphi^l|_{W_x} \text{ is a globally periodic homeomorphism of } W_x.$$

Proof. Every $x \in X \setminus \mathcal{E}$ has an open neighborhood $V_x \subset X \setminus \mathcal{E}$ that contains no orbit. If not, there is a sequence $\{x_k\}$ in converging in X to x such that

$$t \in \mathbb{R} \implies \lim_{k \rightarrow \infty} \|\varphi^t x_k - x_k\| = 0,$$

whence $t \in \mathbb{R} \implies \varphi^t x = x$. But this gives the contradiction $x \in \mathcal{E}$.

As $\mathcal{P}(\varphi)$ is dense, there exist periodic points p_x, q_x such that:

$$p_x \ll x \ll q_x, \quad [p_x, q_x] \subset V_x, \quad O(p_x) \neq O(q_x).$$

Define W_x to be the open order interval $[[p_x, q_x]]$. By Proposition 1 there exists $l > 0$ such that $\varphi^l|_{W_x}$ is densely periodic. Therefore Theorem 3 implies $\varphi^l|_{W_x}$ is globally periodic.

To finish the proof of Theorem 1, observe that φ is pointwise periodic by Proposition 2. Therefore Theorem 4 implies φ is globally periodic. ■

References

- [1] D. Angeli, M. Hirsch & E. Sontag, *Attractors in coherent systems of differential equations*, *Differential Equations* **246** (2009), 3058–3076.
- [2] R. Anguelov, Y. Dumont & J. Lubuma, *Mathematical modeling of sterile insect technology for control of anopheles mosquito*, *Computers & Mathematics with Applications* **64** (2012), 374–389.
- [3] M. Benaïm & M. Hirsch, *Stochastic approximation algorithms with constant step size whose average is cooperative*, *Annals Applied Probability* **9** (1999), 216–241.
- [4] M. Benaïm & M. Hirsch, *Mixed equilibria and dynamical systems arising from fictitious play in repeated games*, *Games & Economic Behavior* **29** (1999), 36–72.
- [5] H. Bohr, *Another proof of Kronecker's theorem*, *Proceedings London Mathematical Society* **2-21** (1923), 315–316.

[‡]For analogs of Montgomery's Theorem in countable transformation groups, see KAUL [22], ROBERTS [37], YANG [50]. Pointwise periodic homeomorphisms on compact metric spaces are studied in HALL & SCHWEIGERT [13].

- [6] P. De Leenheer, *The puzzle of partial migration*, J. Theoretical Biology **412** (2017), 172–185.
- [7] G. Dirr, H. Ito, A. Rantzer & B. Rüffer, *Separable Lyapunov functions for monotone systems: constructions and limitations*, Discrete & Continuous Dynamical Systems Series B **20** (2015), 2497–2526.
- [8] E. Balreira, S. Elaydi & R. Luis, *Global stability of higher dimensional monotone maps*, J. Difference Equations & Applications **23** (2017), 2037–2071.
- [9] G. Enciso & E. Sontag, *Global attractivity, I/O monotone small-gain theorems, and biological delay systems*, Discrete & Continuous Dynamical Systems **14** (2006), 249–578.
- [10] G. Enciso & W. Just, *Analogues of the Smale and Hirsch theorems for cooperative Boolean and other discrete systems*, J. Difference Equations & Applications **12** (2012), 223–238.
- [11] E. Grant, “Nicole Oresme and the kinematics of circular motion: Tractatus de commensurabilitate vel incommensurabilitate motuum celi”, University Wisconsin Press (1971).
- [12] S. Grossberg, *Competition, decision and consensus*, J. Mathematical Analysis & Applications, **66** (1978), 470–493.
- [13] D. Hall & G. Schweigert, *Properties of invariant sets under pointwise periodic homeomorphisms*, Duke Math. J. **4** (1938), 719–724.
- [14] P. Hartman “Ordinary Differential Equations”, John Wiley & Sons (1964).
- [15] P. Hess & P. Polacik, *Boundedness of prime periods of stable cycles and convergence to fixed points in discrete monotone dynamical systems*, SIAM J. Mathematical Analysis **24** (1993), 1312–1330.
- [16] M. Hirsch, *Systems of Differential Equations that are Competitive or Cooperative II: Convergence Almost Everywhere*, SIAM J. Mathematical Analysis **16** (1985), 432–439.
- [17] M. Hirsch, *Stability and convergence in strongly monotone dynamical systems*, J. die Reine und Angewandte Mathematik **383** (1988), 1–53.
- [18] M. Hirsch, *Monotone dynamical systems with polyhedral order cones and dense periodic points*, AIMS Mathematics **2** (2017), 24–27.
- [19] M. Hirsch & H.L. Smith, *Monotone Dynamical Systems*, “Handbook of Differential Equations: Ordinary Differential Equations, Vol. 2, 239–258. Editors: A. Cañada, P. Drábek, A. Fonda. Elsevier North Holland, Boston, Massachusetts (2005).
- [20] E. Kamke, *Zur Theorie der Systeme gewöhnlicher differential-gleichungen, II*, Acta Mathematica, **58** (1932), 57–85.
- [21] A. Kar, *Weyl’s Equidistribution Theorem*, Resonance **8** (2003), 30–37.

- [22] S. Kaul, *On pointwise periodic transformation groups*, Proceedings American Mathematical Society, **27** (1971), 391–394.
- [23] A. Kolmogorov, *Sulla teoria di Volterra della lotta per l'esistenza*, Giornale Istituto Ital. Attuari, **7** (1936), 74–80.
- [24] L. Kronecker, *Näherungsweise ganzzahlige Auflösung linearer Gleichungen*, Werke 3, Chelsea reprint (1968), 47–109.
- [25] A. Lajmanovich & J. Yorke, *A deterministic model for gonorrhea in a nonhomogeneous population*, Mathematical Biosciences **28** (1976), 221–236.
- [26] A. Landsberg & E. Friedman, *Dynamical Effects of Partial Orderings in Physical Systems*, Physical Review E, **54** (1996), 3135–3141.
- [27] B. Lemmens, O. van Gaans & H. van Imhoff, *Monotone dynamical systems with dense periodic points*, Journal of Differential Equations **265** 2018, 5709–5715.
- [28] W. Leonard & R. May, *Nonlinear aspects of competition between species*, SIAM J. Applied Mathematics **29** (1975), 243–275.
- [29] H. Matano, *Strongly order-preserving local semi-dynamical systems-Theory and Applications*. “Semigroups, Theory and Applications, Volume 1.” Editors: H. Brezis, M. Crandall, F. Kappel. Research Notes in Mathematics **141**, Longman Scientific & Technical, London, 178–185 (1986).
- [30] J. Mierczyn'ski, *P-arcs in strongly monotone discrete-time dynamical systems*, Differential & Integral Equations, **7** (1994), 1473–1494.
- [31] D. Montgomery, *Pointwise periodic homeomorphisms*, American J. Mathematics **59** (1937), 118–120.
- [32] D. Montgomery & L. Zippin, “Topological Transformation Groups,” Interscience (1955).
- [33] M.H.A. Newman, *A theorem on periodic transformation of spaces*, Quarterly Journal of Mathematics **2** (1931), 1–8.
- [34] C. Potzsche, *Order-preserving nonautonomous discrete dynamics: Attractors and entire solutions*, Positivity **19** (2015), 547–576.
- [35] R. Redheffer & W. Walter, *Flow-invariant sets and differential inequalities in normed spaces*, Applicable Analysis **5** (1975) 149–1611.
- [36] R. Redheffer & Walter, *Remarks on ordinary differential equations in ordered Banach spaces*, Monatshefte Mathematik. **102** (1986), 237–249.
- [37] J. Roberts, *Pointwise finite families of mappings*, Canadian Mathematical Bulletin **18** (1975), 767–768.

- [38] J. Selgrade, *Mathematical analysis of a cellular control process with positive feedback*, SIAM J. Applied Mathematics **36** (1979), 219–229.
- [39] K. Sigmund, *Kolmogorov and population dynamics*. “Kolmogorov’s heritage in mathematics,” Editors: E. Charpentier, A. Lesne, N. Nikolski. Springer, Berlin (2007).
- [40] S. Smale, *On the differential equations of species in competition*, J. Math. Biology **3** (1976), 5–7.
- [41] H. L. Smith, “Monotone Dynamical Systems, an introduction to the theory of competitive and cooperative systems,” Math. Surveys & Monographs, No. 41, American Mathematical Society, Providence, Rhode Island (1995).
- [42] H. L. Smith, *Monotone dynamical systems: reflections on new advances & applications*, Discrete & Continuous Dynamical Systems Series B, **37** (2017), 485–504.
- [43] D. Speyer, <https://mathoverflow.net/questions/75777> (2017).
- [44] P. Volkmann, *Gewöhnliche Differentialungleichungen mit quasimonoton wachsenden Funktionen in topologischen Vektorräumen*, Mathematische Zeitschrift **17** (1972), 157–164.
- [45] L. Feng, Y. Wang & J. Wu, *Semiflows monotone with respect to high-rank cones on a Banach space*, SIAM J. Math. Analysis **49** (2017), 142–161.
- [46] S. Walcher, *On cooperative systems with respect to arbitrary orderings*, J. Math. Analysis & Applications **263** (2001), 543–554.
- [47] H. Weyl, *Über die Gibbs’sche Erscheinung und verwandte Konvergenz Phänomene*, Rendiconti del Circolo Matematico di Palermo **330** (1910), 377–407.
- [48] H. Weyl, *Über die Gleichverteilung von Zahlen mod. Eins*, Mathematischen Annalen **77** (1916), 313–352.
- [49] C. Wilson, Review of GRANT [11]. Speculum **48** (1973), 565–571.
- [50] J. Yang, *Pointwise periodic transformation groups*, Notices American Mathematical Society **18** (1971), page 830.